EXHIBIT D

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 2 of 28 PageID #: 123574 Elizabeth Mueller, MD, MSME, FACS

| 23 | GOLKOW TECHNOL | OGIES, INC. |
|----------|-------------------------------------|------------------------|
| 21 22 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 18 | Rosemont, | Illinois |
| 17 | March 11, 2017 | |
| 16 | | |
| 15 | **TVT and | * |
| 14 | ELIZABETH MUELLER, M.D., MSME, FACS | |
| 13 | GENERAL EXPERT DEPOSITION OF | |
| 12 | | |
| 11 | |) |
| 1 10 | |) |
| 10 | Case No. 2:12cv04144 |) |
| 9 | Connie Thate |) |
| | |) |
| 8 | PLAINTIFFS: |) |
| | WAVE CASES AND |) |
| 7 | ALL WAVE 4 AND SUBSEQUENT |) |
| | THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO |) U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE |
| 6 | |) JOSEPH R. GOODWIN |
| | |) |
| 5 | LITIGATION |) MDL 2327 |
| | PRODUCTS LIABILITY |) |
| 4 | |) 2:12-MD-02327 |
| | IN RE: ETHICON, INC., |) Magter File No |
| 3 | | 1 |
| 2 | SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST | VIRGINIA AT CHARLESTON |
| | IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT | |

- 1 Exact?
- 2 A. Yes.
- Q. Are you able to split, you know, give me
- 4 a number for each?
- 5 A. No.
- Q. What do you currently use?
- 7 A. TVT Exact.
- Q. Why do you use TVT Exact over the TVT
- 9 original?
- 10 A. Well, I like the smaller -- I like the
- 11 smaller introducer.
- Q. So, the smaller trocar?
- 13 A. The smaller trocar.
- Q. What is the diameter of the trocar for
- the TVT Retropubic original?
- 16 A. I have no idea.
- Q. And the TVT Exact is a 3 millimeter
- 18 trocar, is that correct?
- 19 A. It sounds right.
- Q. Would the TVT Retropubic trocar be
- 21 around 4 to 5 millimeters? A fair estimate?
- MS. SCHMID: Objection; foundation. Go ahead.
- BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't know. I think it's a little bit

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 4 of 28 PageID #: 123576

```
1
     TVT Retropubic slings, do you do it under general
 2
     anesthesia?
 3
                It depends.
          Α.
 4
          0.
                Do you do it under just local sometimes?
 5
          Α.
                Never.
 6
          Q.
                So, when you say "It depends," what do
 7
     you mean by that?
 8
                Well, there is spinal anesthesia, too.
 9
                So, you either use spinal or general
          Q.
10
     anesthesia?
11
          Α.
                That's correct.
12
          Q.
                And what about local, do you do local in
13
     addition to spinal?
14
          Α.
                Yes.
15
          Q.
                And general?
16
          Α.
                Yes.
17
                Doctor, I know that in your report you
          Ο.
18
     talk about mechanically-cut mesh as well as
19
     laser-cut mesh.
20
                Do you know how many mechanically-cut
21
     mesh that you've implanted?
22
          Α.
                No.
23
          Q.
                What about the laser-cut mesh?
24
          Α.
                No.
```

- Q. Do you have a percentage between the
- 2 two?
- 3 A. No.
- Q. So, you don't make a concerted effort to
- 5 determine which kind of mesh you're implanting?
- A. You know, there is not a thing in the
- 7 literature that suggests that that makes any
- 8 difference. So, no, that's not something that I
- 9 look at.
- Q. Doctor, would you -- do you believe that
- 11 mechanically-cut mesh can fray prior to
- 12 implantation?
- 13 A. I don't -- I don't have that much of an
- opinion on it.
- Q. When you implanted the mechanically-cut
- mesh, was it clear or blue?
- 17 A. I don't remember.
- MS. SCHMID: If you know.
- 19 BY MS. LIU:
- Q. Currently the mesh that you're
- implanting is blue, is that correct?
- A. That's correct.
- Q. Do you remember implanting clear mesh?
- A. I -- I'm -- I don't know.

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 6 of 28 PageID #: 123578

- 1 that's, you know -- the plastic that's around it.
- 2 And I implant those myself. I haven't seen blue
- 3 particles when I pull the sheaths out. So, I
- 4 haven't seen blue particles.
- Q. And, Doctor, you say that you have been
- 6 using TVT Exact pretty much since it came out, is
- 7 that correct?
- A. I don't know. I don't know when it was,
- 9 so I can't say if it's when it came out.
- Q. And the TVT Exact uses the laser-cut
- 11 mesh, is that correct?
- 12 A. You would have to tell me.
- MS. SCHMID: Objection; foundation.
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. You would have to tell me that. I
- 16 don't.
- 17 BY MS. LIU:
- Q. So, you're not aware of whether or not
- 19 the TVT Exact uses laser-cut mesh or
- 20 mechanically-cut mesh?
- 21 A. No.
- Q. And, Doctor, I want to go through the
- 23 process of how the mesh is handed to you.
- You mentioned once it's taken out of the

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 7 of 28 PageID #: 123579

```
1
                     meant for you to use different
 2
                      introducers than the ones that's
 3
                     attached, is it?)
 4
     BY THE WITNESS:
 5
          Α.
                I guess not. I don't -- I don't
     understand what this is about. I'm not -- I have
 6
 7
     placed the sling every day.
                I am, by the way, an engineer and have a
 8
 9
     Master's Degree in engineering.
10
                All I do is pass the sling behind the
11
    pubic bone.
12
    BY MS. LIU:
13
          0.
                And, Doctor, I'm just asking some
14
    questions about whether or not, since -- okay.
15
    Let's strike that.
16
                Doctor, you're -- you have a Master's
17
    Degree in engineering, correct?
18
          Α.
                That's right.
19
                And as far as an engineer goes, have you
          Q.
20
    ever designed a trocar?
21
          Α.
                No.
22
                And if you could design a trocar,
    Doctor, would you use your own trocar, take the TVT
23
24
    mesh off of the trocar that it's attached to and
```

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 8 of 28 PageID #: 123580

Elizabeth Mueller, MD, MSME, FACS

1 in mechanical engineering, correct? 2 Α. That's right. 3 Q. Doctor, when you -- strike that. 4 How many years did you work as an 5 engineer? 6 Α. Six. 7 And based on your report, it looks like Q. you were a manufacturing engineer, is that correct? 8 9 Α. No. I was a manufacturing manager, but 10 I had specific engineering responsibilities. 11 And as far as the engineering Ο. responsibilities go, was it more from a production 12 13 standpoint or design standpoint? 14 It was from a production standpoint. 15 Did you design any products during your Ο. 16 time as an engineer? 17 Α. No. 18 And, Doctor, with your engineering Q. background, have you designed any mesh devices? 19 20 Α. No. 21 Ο. And when you were an engineer, was it an 22 engineering in a medical device product? 23 Α. No. 24 What was the product that you were Q.

- 1 working on?
- 2 A. It was dishwashing -- Cascade -- it was
- for Procter & Gamble. So, I worked in high-speed
- 4 manufacturing.
- Q. And it was, you said, Cascade
- 6 dishwashing liquid?
- 7 A. That was the final job.
- Q. Was it with Procter & Gamble your entire
- 9 career as an engineer?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 Q. So, Doctor, you don't have any
- 12 experience designing mesh products, is that
- 13 correct?
- A. No, I don't.
- Q. Doctor, have you only ever used the
- 16 Gynecare TVT products for slings?
- 17 A. No. I think there was -- I just said
- that, that there was a period in which we didn't
- use Gynecare products for slings. I don't remember
- what was the manufacturer. It was a short-lived
- 21 experience at Loyola, and it had to do with cost
- 22 concerns when we were bought by Trinity.
- Q. Do you remember how long ago this was?
- 24 A. I don't.

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 10 of 28 PageID #: 123582

- 1 might be a recurrence and someone would have to do
- 2 another surgery that's close by.
- So, I just choose not to use it then.
- 4 Q. And, Doctor, you've reviewed the IFU for
- 5 the TVT Retropubic, is that correct?
- A. You know, I don't typically review IFUs.
- 7 So, I can't ever remember -- I remember the first
- 8 time that I wrote an operative note. I went
- 9 through the IFU just looking at it, but that wasn't
- 10 how I decided to put the sling in.
- So, I don't typically read IFUs, no.
- 12 Q. And, Doctor, did you review the IFU
- prior to putting together your expert report?
- 14 A. There was -- I glanced at a couple IFUs.
- 15 But, again, I -- I was going to read it. I know
- that that's one of the big legal issues. But then
- 17 I thought I would just reflect what truly has been
- my practice, that I don't read device IFUs.
- I base my decisions off of the way I was
- 20 taught, the way I teach, and the clinical trials
- 21 I've participated in.
- Q. Doctor, do you know whether it is a
- 23 contraindication in the IFU that somebody has had a
- 24 tumor at the bladder neck or any of those other

```
1
     procedures that you had described as
 2
     contraindicated for the TVT sling?
 3
          MS. SCHMID: Objection; form, foundation.
 4
     you have a copy of the IFU for the doctor?
 5
          MS. LIU: I do not.
 6
          MS. SCHMID:
                       Okay.
 7
     BY THE WITNESS:
 8
          Α.
                I don't know.
 9
     BY MS. LIU:
                And, Doctor, so, in drafting your
10
          Q.
11
     report, you did not rely on the IFU, is that
12
     correct?
13
                No, I wouldn't rely on the IFU.
          Α.
14
          Ο.
                And not even for the expert opinion that
     you have provided?
15
16
          Α.
                No.
17
                And, Doctor, you've never drafted an IFU
          Q.
18
    before, have you?
19
          Α.
                No.
20
                Would you consider yourself an IFU
          Q.
21
    expert?
```

- A. I don't really know what you even mean
- 23 by an IFU. I mean, Instructions for Use. So, no,
- 24 I wouldn't consider myself a -- I consider myself a

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 12 of 28 PageID #: 123584 Elizabeth Mueller, MD, MSME, FACS

```
1
     surgical teacher and a teacher expert, but I'm not
 2
     an IFU expert.
 3
          Ο.
                You've never drafted any kind of
     labeling for a medical device --
 4
 5
          Α.
                No.
 6
          Ο.
                -- is that correct?
 7
          Α.
                No, I have not.
 8
                Have you ever given any opinions to a
          Q.
 9
     medical device company as to what they needed in
10
     their IFU?
11
          Α.
                No.
12
          Q.
                Doctor, you provided two reliance lists
13
     for your expert report. Do you recall that?
14
          Α.
                Yes.
15
                     (WHEREUPON, certain documents were
16
                     marked Mueller (TVT/TVT-0) Exhibit
17
                     No. 5, General Reliance List in
18
                     Addition to Materials Referenced in
19
                     Report, MDL Wave 4, and No. 6,
20
                     Supplemental General Reliance List
21
                     in Addition to Materials Referenced
22
                     in Report, MDL Wave 4.)
23
    BY MS. LIU:
24
                Doctor, I'm handing you what I have
          0.
```

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 13 of 28 PageID #: 123585

Elizabeth Mueller, MD, MSME, FACS

1 I just want to ask in general did you Q. read everything? 2 3 Α. I didn't read everything. 4 Q. Did you read the internal documents? 5 Α. I did not. 6 Q. Did you read the company witness 7 depositions? 8 Α. No. 9 So, would it be fair to say that you did 0. 10 not rely on any internal company documents in 11 drafting your report? That would be fair to say that. 12 Α. 13 Q. And would it be fair to say that you did not rely on any of the corporate witness 14 15 depositions? 16 Α. That's right. I did not rely on those. 17 Do you know why they're on your reliance Ο. list? 18 19 Α. I suppose. I don't know. 20 Doctor, do you know how the company 21 documents were selected to be provided to you? 22 Α. I have -- I don't know. 23 And have you reviewed any of them? Ο. 24 Α. No.

- 1 Q. Do you believe that companies would put
- 2 less information in their IFUs than what is
- 3 necessary?
- 4 A. No.
- MS. SCHMID: Objection; form, foundation.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. No, I don't believe that. I just don't
- 8 believe that it's in any kind of context. So, it
- 9 doesn't -- physicians don't read IFUs I believe.
- 10 Q. And --
- 11 A. So, I don't -- I can't comment on what
- 12 should be in an IFU or what is in an IFU because
- it's not something I'm reading. It's not something
- 14 I'm teaching and I'm certainly not teaching people
- 15 to read.
- I'm teaching them to go to the
- 17 literature, read about what your -- what procedures
- 18 are indicated, and there is plenty of literature
- 19 for us to understand what to do for patients.
- Q. Now, you stated that you started using
- 21 slings for this TOMUS trial, correct?
- A. That's correct.
- Q. And you never used them prior to the
- 24 TOMUS trial?

- 1 A. No, no.
- Q. Doctor, do you believe that the TVT
- 3 sling can degrade?
- 4 A. No.
- Q. And how have you come to that
- 6 conclusion?
- 7 A. I've come to that conclusion based on
- 8 work.
- 9 So, when we started, when Dr. Brubaker
- was over at Rush, this was before I was even in the
- 11 fellowship program, they were always using fascial
- 12 slings for sacral colpopexy. Well, they were using
- mesh for sacral colpopexy and they were using
- 14 fascial slings for -- they were using fascial
- 15 slings for stress incontinence.
- I'm sorry. I'm just fading a little
- 17 bit.
- And, so, they went to a meeting and they
- 19 found that people were using cadaveric tissue to do
- slings and to do sacral colpopexy.
- So, Dr. Brubaker, based on that data,
- changed her practice and put in something like 35
- 23 slings that were cadaveric and put in a bunch of
- 24 sacral colpopexies that were cadaveric.

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 16 of 28 PageID #: 123588

- 1 Q. So, Doctor, what you've described, I
- 2 believe, in the cadaveric slings were --
- A. Okay.
- Q. -- you're talking about the material
- being absorbed into the woman's body, is that
- 6 correct?
- A. I'm talking about being degraded.
- 8 Q. So, that's your terminology for
- 9 degradation?
- 10 A. Right.
- Q. So, if the surface of the TVT is cracked
- or peeled or blistered, do you consider that to be
- 13 degradation?
- MS. SCHMID: Objection.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. No.
- MS. SCHMID: Form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. First, we don't see that. When we take
- 20 a look at electron microscopy images where instead
- of leaving the little protein coating that's on --
- you know, if you spit on something and if you spit
- on like plastic and it dries, there is a film on
- 24 it. That doesn't mean that the plastic has made

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 17 of 28 PageID #: 123589

- 1 that itself. If you wash that off, then it's gone.
- 2 And there is nice images that show that
- 3 that little protein layer is what people thought
- 4 was disintegrating and actually the mesh is intact.
- So, no, I don't believe that it's
- 6 disintegrating or degrading, excuse me, was the
- 7 word you used.
- 8 Q. Have you looked at explanted mesh under
- 9 microscope?
- 10 A. I haven't.
- 11 Q. So, you haven't cleaned the mesh to look
- 12 at it, correct?
- A. Well, I would have to say that it
- 14 wouldn't be something -- we can't appreciate on
- 15 your version of degradation under a microscope. It
- has to be done under an electron microscope. Not
- even a microscope sees what you're talking about.
- So, when you look at images of electron
- 19 microscopy where the mesh has been put into
- solutions that degrade, that protein layer, we see
- 21 an intact mesh.
- Q. And, Doctor, do you believe that the TVT
- 23 sling is an inert material?
- 24 A. Yes.

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 18 of 28 PageID #: 123590

- Q. And that's why you also don't believe
- that it degrades, is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Do you know whether or not there are
- 5 antioxidants added to the TVT prior to its
- 6 manufacture?
- 7 A. I don't --
- MS. SCHMID: Objection; foundation.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. I don't know if there is antioxidants
- 11 added.
- 12 BY MS. LIU:
- Q. So, you've never -- you've never come
- 14 across materials that say that there are
- antioxidants that are added to the TVT, correct?
- MS. SCHMID: Same objection. Go ahead.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. No.
- 19 BY MS. LIU:
- Q. Now, if there are antioxidants added to
- the TVT to prevent it from, as you would call it,
- degrading or from it having an inert property,
- would you be concerned with what those antioxidants
- 24 are?

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 19 of 28 PageID #: 123591

- 1 MS. SCHMID: Objection; form, foundation.
- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. No. Again, when I put Prolene sutures
- 4 in people or when I use a Prolene mesh and I go
- 5 back later or I'm taking it out or I'm visualizing
- 6 it on ultrasound, I'm not seeing degradation,
- 7 curling, coiling, unbraiding, all of those things.
- 8 So, while they might be phenomena that
- 9 happen in a laboratory, they might be phenomena
- 10 that people are pontificating around, when it comes
- 11 to clinical trials and taking care of women, these
- 12 are not the things that are making an impact and
- 13 results.
- We never looked at the fascial sling
- 15 like this. We never looked at the Burch
- urethropexy, which, by the way, used Gore-Tex
- 17 sutures and Prolene sutures.
- So, when we look at surgical outcomes,
- 19 these are not factors that are making a difference.
- Q. Now, Doctor, we've established earlier
- 21 that when you did your ultrasounds, you did not
- 22 measure the width of the sling in the retropubic
- 23 space, correct?
- A. That's correct.

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 20 of 28 PageID #: 123592

- 1 statistically significant difference. But not now.
- Q. Doctor, do you know whether or not
- 3 Ethicon internally thought about putting out a
- 4 lighter weight mesh?
- 5 A. I have no idea.
- 6 MS. SCHMID: Objection; form, foundation.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. Yeah, I've already testified that I did
- 9 not read any of the internal documents. So, I have
- 10 no sense of what the internal workings have been of
- 11 Ethicon.
- 12 BY MS. LIU:
- Q. Do you know whether or not in your
- 14 discussions in the past with Ethicon that they
- believed that the polypropylene was not inert?
- MS. SCHMID: Objection; form, foundation.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I'd like to -- I don't know what you
- mean by my discussions with Ethicon. I've never
- 20 been a consultant with Ethicon.
- I've never talked with them about their
- 22 product other than conversations at conventions
- where I am having a drink and barely paying
- 24 attention to what anybody is saying besides myself.

- 1 product, correct?
- A. Never.
- Q. Now, Doctor, why did you not review any
- 4 of the internal documents in drafting your paper?
- A. You know, I felt when I sat down and
- 6 started this work and I was going to make comment
- 7 about the care of patients and what was happening
- 8 to them, that I could only stay within the realm of
- 9 what is my experience and understanding and that
- 10 that's what I was being asked to do.
- I can't possibly understand what those
- documents mean or what in context they are.
- I can understand this world. This is my
- 14 world. This is the world I publish in. This is
- the world I talk in. These are the patients I am
- 16 treating and caring for.
- So, I kept my understanding to the world
- 18 I live in, and I think that's important.
- Q. And you don't believe that the people
- who actually designed or tested the product, their
- input would make any difference in your opinion?
- A. Well, I'm being deposed as an expert
- witness and the only expert part of me is the
- doctor part of me. All that other stuff, I'm not

- an expert on. I don't even understand it when I'm
- 2 reading it.
- So, I would help no one. I wouldn't
- 4 help you in your case. I certainly wouldn't help
- 5 Ethicon in their case by what are my
- 6 interpretations. I have no idea what I'm reading.
- 7 Q. So, anything dealing with the design,
- 8 the pore size, the weight, none of that is in your
- 9 purview, is that correct?
- 10 A. That's correct, because what I'm looking
- 11 at is when that mesh was put in patients, and we
- 12 look, did it help them with their symptoms and what
- were the complications, that's all that matters to
- 14 me.
- 15 Independent of all this stuff that went
- into the black box over here, I'm looking at what
- was the outcome. And -- yeah.
- Q. So, you're specifically -- your report
- is based on clinical outcomes, your clinical
- outcomes, is that correct?
- A. Not my clinical outcomes. The clinical
- outcomes of my field that's reported in the
- international and national literature.
- 24 Q. Now --

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 23 of 28 PageID #: 123595 Elizabeth Mueller, MD, MSME, FACS

1 Q. Yes, Doctor.

- A. Great.
- 3 Q. So, you never compared the differences
- 4 between any of the IFUs that Ethicon put out,
- 5 correct?
- A. I did not, but I read the testimony of
- other physicians who have talked about that in
- 8 detail.
- 9 Q. Now, Doctor, you also testified that you
- 10 have never been to any of the professional
- 11 education courses, correct?
- 12 A. I haven't been to ones where they were
- teaching how to pass a sling. I have been, of
- 14 course, in the room when we are doing like, let's
- 15 say, an AUGS course and at an AUGS course they have
- 16 borrowed somebody's models or they have got
- 17 pelvises or they have got slings and they're right
- next door doing something while I am teaching them
- 19 how to do a Burch or how to do to a ureteral
- 20 repair. So, those things get really fuzzy
- 21 sometimes, you know.
- Q. Have you reviewed professional education
- 23 materials that Ethicon has put out?
- 24 A. No.

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 24 of 28 PageID #: 123596

- 1 Q. Have you heard of the Surgeon's
- 2 Monograph that Ethicon put out?
- A. No. I've heard of Surgeon's Monographs
- 4 in general, but I haven't heard of Ethicon's or
- 5 read it.
- Q. Okay. I would like you to turn to
- 7 page 9 of your expert report.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. If you look at -- this is -- actually,
- if you turn to page 8, you will see that this falls
- 11 under "Medical Opinions."
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. And do you see that the opinion, the
- No. 6 opinion that you have, states, "The IFUs,
- 15 monographs and professional education materials for
- 16 TVT and TVT-O adequately and accurately reflect the
- 17 complications specific to the device that are
- described in the medical literature."
- So, Doctor, how can you make this
- opinion when you haven't reviewed the materials?
- A. That's true.
- Q. So, at this point in time, Doctor, can
- you make an opinion at all as to the materials that
- were provided by Ethicon to the doctors as to

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 25 of 28 PageID #: 123597

- whether or not they were sufficient?
- 2 A. No.
- Q. And, Doctor, you spent a total of 19 --
- 4 I'm sorry. Strike that.
- Doctor, you spent a total of 18 hours
- 6 preparing for the TVT and TVT-0 general report, is
- 7 that correct?
- 8 A. That's true.
- 9 Q. And did that encompass all the time that
- 10 you reviewed medical literature?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And it included the entire time that you
- drafted the report?
- 14 A. Yes, and read. I mean, you know, even
- though they are studies I'm familiar with, to sit
- down and read them and try to categorize or
- 17 hole-punch them and put them into a binder, those
- 18 things, things take time.
- Q. And that was just in generating this
- 20 particular report?
- A. Yes. The general report.
- Q. And, Doctor, if you will look at your
- report again and it's No. 7 on page 9.
- Your opinion that there was insufficient

Case 2:12-md-02327 Document 3610-4 Filed 04/13/17 Page 26 of 28 PageID #: 123598

- 1 versus laparoscopic sacral colpopexy.
- This was a study that was awarded to Kim
- 3 Kenton and myself at Loyola and also to Jennifer
- 4 Anger at UCLA.
- And when we sat down to start designing
- 6 the trial, we had to agree on a single mesh and at
- 7 the time we were using the Gynecare mesh. They
- 8 were using the Mpathy mesh. Pamela Moalli's work
- 9 had come out about the Mpathy mesh. And, so, we
- just decided that we would go with what UCLA had
- 11 moving forward and made that transition.
- And I haven't handled that mesh or seen
- that mesh for years now. I mean, probably we did
- that in, I don't remember, maybe 2009 or 2010. So,
- 15 I don't have much of a memory of it.
- Q. And I believe we talked about a little
- 17 bit about the fact that you don't really have an
- 18 expertise as far as whether the TVT sling should be
- 19 lighter weight or larger pore, is that correct?
- 20 A. I don't.
- Q. So, you don't hold yourself as a
- 22 materials design expert, correct?
- A. Not on mesh, no.
- Q. Doctor, have you heard of the TOPA mesh?

- 1 A. Excuse me?
- Q. The TOPA, T-O-P-A?
- A. I haven't.
- Q. Give me one second here.
- Doctor, if you will turn to page 24 of
- 6 your report.
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you see in the middle of that first
- 9 paragraph there where you --
- MS. SCHMID: Hold on one second, counsel. I
- just want to get to page 24.
- 12 BY MS. LIU:
- Q. Are you there, Doctor?
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you see the sentence where it starts
- with "Ethicon conducted testing on a lighter
- weight, larger pore, partially absorbable sling,
- but it failed multiple cadaver labs"?
- A. Yes. I didn't know the name of that was
- 20 TOPA.
- Q. And, Doctor, this is -- you cite an
- internal memo with a Bates number.
- Now, you testified earlier that you
- 24 never looked at any internal documents?

- A. I did look at that one. I'm sorry.
- 2 Q. So, you did look at one?
- A. Excuse me. I'm sorry.
- Q. Okay. And, Doctor, do you know why
- 5 Ethicon was looking to develop a lighter weight
- 6 partially absorbable mesh?
- 7 MS. SCHMID: Objection; foundation.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. I don't know. But I think there was --
- when I read in the literature about like what makes
- 11 the perfect mesh and what -- many people have
- 12 talked about an absorbable coating, that somehow
- there was absorption, then there would be more
- ingrowth and maybe less inflammation. So, that's
- 15 what I assumed.
- I have seen that with a couple different
- 17 companies that have been trying to do that.
- 18 BY MS. LIU:
- 19 Q. And, Doctor, you expect to see an acute
- 20 chronic body -- I'm sorry. Strike that.
- You expect to see acute inflammation
- 22 after placing a sling, is that correct?
- A. I expect to see acute inflammation after
- I do any surgery. The minute I put my scissors in